An Intercultural Study on the Characteristics of Mother Tongue Education Course Books' Content¹

Berker KURT²

Akdeniz University

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to set the characteristics of the contents of the course books that are prepared for the lessons of mother tongue education in secondary schools in different countries. Within the frame of the purpose, the content of the course books in Germany, Austria, Finland, Northern Macedonia, Hungary and Turkey were analyzed in three aspects. The first of all is about which sections are included in the general content, the second is about how the classification of the content was made and finally the third one includes how the language skills and the fields of learning are placed in the content. Figured in a quantitative way and the document of the research in which the content analyzed is composed by the 23 course books used in the countries that are mentioned above. In the analysis of the data 3 arguments and a checklist that enables to make a systematic evaluation consists of 28 items is used. As a result of the research, it is confirmed that the content of mother language course books in countries differ from each other due to the general properties of content; while classifying the course books generally multiplied structure dominated by thematic, functional and grammatical segmentation, it has been determined that all language skills, vocabulary teaching and grammar, both theoretical and practical, are included in the books. At the end of the study, it is recommended to take the course books in Germany and Hungary as an example while preparing the Turkish course books.

Keywords: Mother Tongue Education, Course Books, Content, The Checklist Method.

DOI: 10.29329/epasr.2020.345.11

⁻

¹ This research was supported by Akdeniz University, The Scientific Research Projects Coordination Unit, Project number: SBA-2019-4119.

² Asst. Prof. Dr., Faculty of Education, Akdeniz University, Antalya, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0003-4788-0909 **Correspondence**: berkerakdeniz@gmail.com

Introduction

The child who starts his experience of education with an awareness of basic components of the mother tongue in the first few years of his life, begins to learn the phonological, grammatical, and semantic properties via the mother tongue lessons at school (Gosy, 2005). Mother tongue education, which aims to enable students to acquire language and mental skills related to listening/monitoring, speaking, reading and writing that can be used throughout their lives, to develop themselves individually and socially and to communicate effectively (MEB, 2019), is actually not a part of education but a process that affects the individual's identity, personality, perception and level of the world, shortly, the life of the individual with what he promises or aims. Speaking and listening skills that the child starts to accumulate through acquisition is developed in the school, reading and writing skills are added to them and thus the components of the competence in mother tongue education are completed. With the teaching expressed as deliberate acculturation, it is aimed to gain the highest level of competence in language components.

The process in the mother tongue education goes forward similarly with the contribution of the school as well without concerning the structure of the language and the other properties. However, differences can be seen in the factors like language policies of the countries, language education programs and the materials used for the education. Ministry of National Education in Turkish Republic which takes place in the scope of this research has the responsibility to carry out all the educational activities conducted from the centre. The levels of education is composed of preschool, primary school, secondary school and higher education. Compulsory education in Turkey has been increased up to 12 years since 2012-13 academic year and divided into three stages. The stages are organized as; 4 years of primary school (1,2,3, and 4. grades), 4 years of secondary school (5,6,7, and 8. grades) and 4 years of high school (9. 10. 11. and 12. grades). Besides for the individuals who are in need of special education, preschool education is also compulsory besides the other educations as primary school education, secondary and high school educations (SGM,2017). The main purpose of the Turkish Language Curriculum (MEB, 2019) is the basic level of verbal, numerical and scientific reasoning that students who have completed primary school, within the framework of moral integrity and self-awareness in accordance with their individuality, self-confidence and self-discipline to ensure that they become healthy life-oriented individuals who have gained social skills and aesthetic sensitivity by using them effectively; students who completed secondary school develop competencies gained in primary schools have adopted the national and spiritual values through, fulfilling the uses and responsibilities of their rights related to "Turkey Qualifications Framework" and also ensure to become basic skills and competencies gained individuals as expressed in areas specific to the discipline. The time allocated for Turkish lessons according to the classes in the weekly course hour schedule in primary education (primary, secondary) schools is as follows: 1st and 2nd

grade 10 hours, 3rd and 4th grade 8 hours, 5th and 6th grade 6 hours, 7th and 8th grade 5 hours (TEGM, 2019).

In Germany as being a country, which has the philosophy of providing everybody with equal education opportunity, hands in materials free and ensures everybody to have the high-level education for national and international areas. Federal Ministry of Education and Research is the central constitution of education services and generates general rules only for education.

For this reason, the system of education shows differences between the states. Education is compulsory between the ages 6 and 15. The German education programme in primary schools has three duties: 1- to empower the personality, 2- the talent of adaptation and lifelong learning, 3-deciding together and the ability of involving. In Germany in the province of Berlin when looking at the time allocated to education it can be seen that allocated time to Germany in the first grade is not known exactly because of the reason that unified approach is applied while it is allocated as 6 hours for the second grade, 7 hours in third and fourth grade, 5 hours in fifth and sixth grades.

In Austria that has binary hierarchical system involves not only the central area but also the country in means of educational administration, federal government is in charge in the first place (Memduhoğlu, 2015). Education starts at the age of 6 and involves a 9 year period. The last four years of this process is a well-established and wide-ranging teaching step named as new secondary school (Neue Mittelschule). Australian education curriculum depends on designing of individual learning ways, diversity, equal opportunity and attendance principles. As long as there is no change in the autonomous school curriculums the time determined for the German classes is four hours. German lessons have the aim of providing the students to develop their cognitive skills, to use the creative possibilities and enlarge them, to enable the constructive usage of media. The German classes are designed in order to analyze, judge and criticize the values ethically with a rightful point of view, decide and be able to move. The lingual and cultural diversity in the lessons, should be experienced as community enriching fact (RIS, 2018).

In Finland the basic education is for 9 years. The first six years of this education is sustained with one teacher, next three years by in-field teachers. The basic goals of mother tongue teaching in Finland are lay the foundation of reading and writing skills of the students, improving the learning and interaction skills, developing their self-expressing abilities related to their individual circumstances, encourage lingual diversity and the skills of listening, speaking, reading and writing. Especially since 2015, Finnish education and mother tongue education have been based on cultural diversity and respect. Considering the time allocated to mother tongue education in the teaching process, in the grades 1 and 2 14 hours, between the grades 3-6 18 hours and 7-9 grades 10 hours are reserved for teaching the mother tongue. When the second language education is added to this

planning for the reason that the country has a multilingual conformation, it can be seen that more than half of the 38 hours of weekly course time is allocated for language education (Finlex, 2018).

Education system in Hungary has a central structure. However, responsibilities in the management of schools generally belong to the municipalities. Compulsory education period involves the ages between 5-16. The structure of basic education is generally divided into two as lower level (grades 1-4) and upper level (grades 5-8) in the same school. In the upper level of basic education, which means in the grades from 5 to 8 mother tongue education in the classroom has more than one task and goal. These are briefly as follows;

To enable the students:

- to understand the relationship between nation, small-scale society and individual,
- to learn their culture, thoughts, moral content and aesthetic values, and thus to be mentally and emotionally connected to them,
- to be able to interpret their past, current environment and themselves according to their age and thus be ready to understand and shape this cultural tradition,
 - to learn creative thinking,
 - to have a strong comprehension of a text at this stage of education,
- to develop their creativity so that they can form short texts in the text types they work on and to apply the Hungarian language and spelling rules consciously,
- to express themselves correctly, verbally and in writing according to different communication situations.

In Hungary, it is offered to the teachers to use 80% of the curriculum inside the classroom and 20% outside the classroom (visiting museums, seeing theater performances, inviting famous people for an interview, etc.) for the purpose of deeper, more diverse teaching, repetition, practice or knowledge acquisition, competence development and project work. The curriculum, which has been carried out since 2012, replaced by a new one in the beginning of the new school year 2020. According to these programs, 7 hours in 1st and 2nd grade (7 hours in 2012), 5 hours in 3rd and 4th classes (6 hours in 2012), 4 hours in 5th and 6th years (same in 2012) and in the 7th and 8th grade, 3 hours (the same in 2012) are reserved for Hungarian lessons (Petróczi, 2020).

The education system of the Republic of North Macedonia is organized as preschool, primary school, secondary school and university education. In the country where nine-year primary education and three / four-year high school education are compulsory, eight-year primary education has been

increased to nine years since 2006. The first year includes 6-year-olds and is accepted as a preparatory year. Since the 2007/2008 school year, high school education has also become compulsory and thus children between the ages of 6 and 18 have been involved in compulsory education (Arif, 2008). Although having different ethnic elements, the statement; "Educational studies at primary schools are carried out with Macedonian and Cyrillic alphabet." takes place in the 10th article of the Primary Education Law published in the Official Gazette of North Macedonia with the headline "The Use of Languages in Education". In addition, the provision stating that the students of the members of the community are able to have an education in another language, is included as well. (Службен весник, 2019).

The goal of education in North Macedonia is to raise individuals who respect gender, ethnicity, religion, language, social status, intellectual and physical diversity and who have acquired a democracy culture (Службен весник, 2019). The language lessons and their hours of a primary school in North Macedonia in the 2019-2020 academic year are as follows: 6 hours Macedonian in 1st grade, 5 hours Macedonian and 2 hours Albanian in 2nd grade; In the 3rd grade, 6 hours in Macedonian, 3 hours in Albanian; In the 4th grade, 3 hours in Macedonian, 4 hours in Albanian; 5th grade 5 hours in Macedonian, 2 hours in Albanian; In the 6th grade, 4 hours in Macedonian, 4 hours in Albanian; In the 7th grade, 5 hours Macedonian, 4 hours Albanian; In the 8th grade, 4 hours in Macedonian, 4 hours in Albanian; In the 9th grade, 4 hours in Macedonian, 3 hours in Albanian (Кирил Пејчиновиќ, 2018).

Course Books

Textbooks are accepted as the most basic means of education and training process. Considering and evaluating the textbooks as only a resource containing knowledge or skills of a course is just like stating that an iceberg as just what it is seen. In that case, answering the question - "What is a text book?"- not only as a course book but also from the different point of view will be enough to prove why the text book is a basic tool.

When we have a look at the diachronic definitions of what a textbook is, according to Brammer's (1967) definition, the textbook is a basic tool in which generally accepted principles on a subject are demonstrated, primarily designed for classroom or student-book-teacher interaction (as cited in Laspina, 2009: 28). Textbooks are based on the educators' designs to teach what they believe the students should have. In other words, textbooks tell children what their elders want them to know (Fitzgerald 1979: 47). According to Oğuzkan (1993), the textbook is a book that is recommended as a basic resource for teachers and students for a certain school, class and course after it has been examined according to certain criteria. Graves (2000: 175) states that the textbook is an important and standard source of information for any subject in the context of formal education and an effective tool for the learning-teaching process. According to Häkkinen (2002: 11), textbooks are a non-fictional

type of literature that aims to provide students with basic information about a particular field of study. Garinger (2002) defines textbooks as a basic resource for teachers, a source of inspiration for classroom activities, a source of supportive material, and even the curriculum itself. According to Kalmus (2004), who evaluates textbooks sociologically, textbooks are socialization tools used to convey knowledge and values to the young generation and to ensure the continuity, production or transformation of the social order.

On the other hand Kılıç and Seven (2006) defined the textbook as a suitable tool to apply the strategies, methods and techniques required by the goals and behaviors of the program. Ülper and Yalınkılıç (2010) stated that textbooks are extremely necessary and important educational tools in order to actualize teaching activities in teaching environments. According to Tertemiz, Ercan and Kayabaşı (2011) who states that textbooks are a resource that affects significantly what students will learn in the teaching learning process, especially in deliberate education practices. Erbaş, Alacacı, and Bulut (2012), who approach textbooks functionally, state that textbooks are important tools for teachers to understand the subjects and concepts in their curriculum and to put designed curriculum into practice. In the Ministry of National Education's Regulation on Textbooks and Education Tools (MEB, 2016), the textbook refers to the book approved by the Board (Board of Education and Discipline) to be taught in formal and non-formal education and training institutions.

As it is understood from the definitions, the textbook is the most basic lesson tool that is prepared according to a certain curriculum, provides the correct and necessary exchange of knowledge, skills and / or values between teacher-content-student (Caner & Kurt, 2020). The textbook is a unique tool for the courses for being related to the educational programmes, meeting the expectations of the parties in every sense, being for the general and specific objectives of the course, as well as being prepared in accordance with the national education policies of the country and thus for an effective learning and teaching process to take place.

In addition to these definitions, it is possible to list what the textbook is for the stakeholders who are interested in the textbook as follows:

- 1. For the state, the textbook is the most basic resource in which the characteristics of the individuals desired to be raised are coded, the framework of competence is drawn, norms and behavioral patterns are presented (Pingel, 2010). The answers to the questions of what, how much and when an individual or society should know, what values should have, reveal the state's view of the textbook.
- 2. For the Ministry of Education, the textbook is the most basic resource that provides equal opportunities for each individual participating in the education and training process, both in terms of

acquisition, quality and quantity, in accordance with national education policies and general and specific objectives of education.

- 3. Curriculums are general structures which restrict the currently unlimited knowledge and related applications within the framework of educational activities; Reveals why, when, how much and how valid and necessary information should be transferred to the target audience, and what the expected behavioral changes are. For the curriculum, the textbook is the most basic source where all kinds of rules, rules, goals, methods and strategies within itself become visible and turn into practice. Even Sheldon (1988: 237) considers the textbook to be the visible heart of its program.
- 4. For the teacher the course book is the basic source book which not only both guides to the in class practises but also is a supplementary of the programme that is foreseen to be followed.
- 5. For the students the course book is the most basic source that gives information about the teaching process and provides focusing on the lesson and the teacher.
- 6. For the parents the course book is the most basic source that their children get the knowledge about inputs and outputs in a day at school.

It is possible to extend the list from the viewpoint of different stakeholders. However, it will be an unchanging judgment that the textbook is the most basic resource even in the definitions that are going to be added.

General Content Features of Textbooks

Content features of the textbooks differ according to the aims, subjects and learning areas of the course. In this sense, it is expected that the content planning, division and other content features of a textbook prepared for a mathematics or social studies course will have a different content structure from the mother tongue textbook. Language education, which has a multi-component structure, should have a textbook that contains these components; It is very important in terms of the quality of education and the achievement of the language lessons.

It is possible to examine the content features of mother tongue textbooks under 2 main headings.

1. General Content Units

Which units are involved in the content of textbooks is the subject of the general content classification. Some of these features are valid for all textbooks, while others are only for language lessons. The following units are included in the content classification of the textbooks prepared for language education:

Generic Section: This section is the one where the book is introduced. Important information such as the name of the editor, author and other officials, publisher, edition year and number, information of confirmation from official institutions, foreword, acknowledgment, table of contents, list of figures and graphics, usage information of the book are placed in here. In addition, there are national elements in the generic section of the textbooks in our country, which should be in the generic section according to the Textbooks and Education Tools Regulation (MEB, 2016) prepared by the Ministry of National Education and published in the Official Gazette dated 12.09.2012 and numbered 28409. The Turkish Flag, the National Anthem, Atatürk's Address to the Youth and the portrait painting of Mustafa Kemal Atatürk are among the national elements that must be included in the textbooks and their existence is guaranteed by the relevant regulation.

Usage of the book and Instruction of Guidance: This unit can be a part of the generic section or it can also be considered independently. One of the factors for which the information is given in the section is called the organizational chart. Here, the meaning of the elements all which have a special meaning in the use of the book such as; writing, color, shape, picture, infographic are explained.

Information of Learning Objectives or Outcomes: It is the section in which the learning objectives or learning outcomes are given as items in the unit, theme or chapter entries in the textbooks. This section allows the student to get preliminary information about what behaviours they will gain at the end of the relevant section.

Dictionary, Index, Resources Section: In these categories, the dictionary section; containing the meaning of words, phrases and terms in the back pages of the textbooks, the index section; enables to find terms and names of people easily, the resources section; showing where the theoretical information, text, pictures and similar elements in the book are taken from, are included.

Additional Resources Section: This section includes topics that cannot be explained in the book or in lecture or that require more information and examples.

Author-Poet Bibliography: Basic information such as biographical information, understanding of art and works of the text writers who have productions in the book is usually given at the end of the book. According to the Turkish Language Curriculum (MEB, 2019), it is one of the necessary features of the textbook to include the biographies of the authors or the poets.

Solutions Section: It is the place where the solutions of all the questions and activities in the book are found. Having these parts in the book will provide opportunity to the students to learn by themselves or by using their self-management abilities. While the solution part does not take place in

the mother tongue course books that much, it is generally one of the basic parts and the most needed in the books of foreign language teaching.

2. Structural Content Segmentation

Eight division structures can be mentioned in the textbooks prepared for language teaching: thematic, generic, skill-based, functional/functional, grammatical, chronological, textual and artist-based. These can form the basic structure of the textbook merely or they can be used as multiple or each other's sub-structures, too. For example, the basic structure of a book can be both thematic and functional/operational, or its basic structure can be thematic, and its infrastructure can be skill-based. Among the classifications only textual classification does not show the feature of being a substructure.

Thematic Segmentation: Theme is defined as "a curriculum, a teaching unit, an idea or subject that is adopted and repeated as a basis for an educational activity" (TDK, 1974). In thematically prepared textbooks, the main subject and the sub-topics supporting it are organized by forming a unity.

Textual Segmentation: It is a segmentation feature created by ordering the reading texts without depending any theme, unit or topic. Pre- and post- text questions, genre features, grammar features and writing studies are listed as sub-sections of textual classification.

Generic Segmentation: Literary genres form the criteria in the division of the textbook. The fact that the features and examples of epics, legends, tales, novels and other literary genres shape the mother tongue book shows that a generic classification is made. Text questions, vocabulary studies, genre features and genre-related writing exercises form the sub-sections of the textbooks created in this way. It is possible to encounter this structure mostly in literature books.

Skill-Based Segmentation: Textbooks prepared in line with the skill areas of language education consisting of reading, writing, listening and speaking are skill-based. Language skills constitute the main title in the books prepared in this style. This structure is more likely to be seen in textbooks on foreign language or second language teaching.

Functional / Functional Segmentation: It is a content structure formed by the penetration of task-based teaching method, which is one of the effective language teaching methods, into the textbook, in today's world where language teaching methods have become diversified. This kind of compartmentalization, which aims at the application and production on a subject with a general explanation, background comprehension or perception, is mostly seen in the books prepared for foreign language or second language teaching. For example, after the words, concepts, phrases and grammar rules related to place-direction names are grasped, the pages that enable students to do the

scenario that they will write for the promotion of a different place and then a place in their own country, are of operational / functional structure. Another example can be given from German textbooks in Germany. Each chapter of the textbook is planned under the heading "Learn in three steps (Lernen in drei Schritte)". The first subtitle is called "Basic Part" and aims to make students review their knowledge and develop a core competency area. The second subtitle is called "Integration and Differentiation" and it is aimed to ensure integration with another competency area. The heading "Prepare a possible classroom or project" constitutes the third part and aims to ensure harmony between the knowledge and the student (Wagener, 2014).

Grammatical Segmentation: It is a type of segmentation where grammar subjects constitute the main title. A certain order is followed in this type of segmentation. Explanation of a grammar rule with examples, revealing its similar and different aspects with other rules and exercises form the main structure of grammatical division. It is seen that the use of this structure is common in foreign language teaching books and books in which only grammar rules are conveyed.

Chronological Division: In this classification type, works are sorted according to the date of writing. Word studies, text questions, language and literature features of the period and important developments are included based on the work. Features of types are not important.

Author / Poet Based Segmentation: It is a type of segmentation in which the texts are sorted by bringing the literary characteristics and basic works of the author or poets to the fore. It is similar to chronological classification but basically there is artist, not history.

Research on Textbooks

Mother tongue textbooks have become one of the important topics of language education research and have been evaluated in many studies (Açık Önkaş & Günay,2015; Arı, 2011; Cömert Bayraktar, 2017; Coşkun & Çiftçi, 2019; Çakır, 2013; Deniz, Tarakcı &Karagöl,2019a; Deniz, Tarakcı &Karagöl,2019b; Epçaçan & Okçu, 2010; Gün, 2013; İşeri, 2007; Kadızade &Önder, 2016; Karagöl &Tarakcı, 2018; Lüle Mert, 2011; Solak & Yaylı 2009; Somuncu, 2008; Tarakcı &Karagöl,2019a; Tarakcı &Karagöl,2019b; Türkben, 2019a; Türkben, 2019b; Yazıcı Okuyan, 2012; Yıldız, Altun, Ceran, Dağ & Özgül, 2019) from different perspectives, such as language skills, achievements, curriculum, competence and use.

The review of available literature on textbooks revealed that there are several studies that examined language textbooks published in different countries comparatively concerning some variables, such as covering daily issues (Karababa, 2005); communicative competence elements (Çelik and Caner, 2020); general physical features (Durmuşçelebi, 2007); value transmission (Şentürk and Aktaş, 2015); content coverages (Kurt, 2018); and technology use in textbooks (Kurt & Demir, 2019).

Karababa (2005) examined Turkish and English textbooks in terms their priority in giving place to daily issues and found that English textbooks include more texts dealing with current issues. In another study Celik and Caner (2020) examined the English and Turkish language teaching textbooks concerning their use of communicative competence elements. Their comparative evaluation of the textbooks revealed that although the pragmatic competence component is covered pleasingly, the discourse competence component is covered more effectually in the textbook used in teaching English as a foreign language. Additionally, they found that neither of the textbooks is particularly weak in covering the strategic competence aspects in the speaking activities. As for the physical features of the textbooks, Durmuscelebi (2007) compared textbooks used in Turkey and Germany and found that while textbooks in Turkey did not give importance on the physical features, the textbooks in Germany were mostly more useful and in better quality in terms of the pictures, paintings, and unity of the textbooks. In another study Şentürk and Aktaş (2015) examined 8th grade language textbooks used in Romania and Turkey concerning their coverages in transmitting national values. They found that the textbooks used in Romania were lacking in national value transmission. Similarly, Kurt (2018) examined textbooks used in Turkey and in Hungary concerning various variables and found that the textbooks used in Hungary were richer in terms of their contents and subject coverages. Another study conducted by Kurt and Demir (2019) examined the textbooks used in Turkey, Austria and Hungary concerning their subjects on giving place to technology use. They found that language textbooks used in Austria and Hungary integrated more technology into their issues whereas, the textbooks in Turkey did not give emphasis on integrating technology to their issues.

Purpose of The Research

This research was conducted to reveal the content characteristics of the textbooks used by different countries in mother tongue education and to make comparisons. In order to achieve this aim, the research is founded on the question: "What are the content features of the textbooks used in mother tongue education of different countries?". The sub-problems of working within the framework of this basic problem are the following:

What is the general content view of mother tongue textbooks?

How is the content division of mother tongue textbooks made?

How are language skills and learning fields included in the content of mother tongue textbooks?

Method

Research Model

In this qualitative study, the data were analyzed by content analysis method, which also includes document and descriptive analysis. Document review covers the analysis of written materials containing information about the facts and cases that are aimed to be investigated (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018: 189). The main purpose in content analysis is to reach the concepts and relations that can explain the collected data. The data summarized and interpreted in descriptive analysis are submitted to a deeper process in content analysis, and concepts and themes that cannot be recognized with a descriptive approach can be discovered as at the end of this analysis. The process here is to gather similar data within the framework of certain concepts and themes and to interpret them in a way that the reader can understand (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018: 242).

Data Collecting Tool

In the research, firstly, the literature on how to make an evaluation in line with the purpose and scope of the research was scanned and the textbook evaluation approaches were determined. As a result of the findings, it was concluded that the most appropriate method is the checklist method. The checklist method is a systematic and preferable method because it has listed criteria, these criteria are in order, the steps to be followed by the evaluators are clear and can be done without wasting much time (Caner & Kurt, 2020). By this approach, the data obtained from the evaluation of a book can also be used for comparison with other reviewed books. According to Demir and Ertaş (2014), the checklist is a convenient and practical approach that can be used for practitioners to decide whether a book is effective or not. According to Mukundan, Hajimohammadi and Nimehchisalem (2011), the checklist approach is a miscellaneous and effective approach since more generalizable evaluations will be obtained.

At this stage, the textbook evaluation checklist developed by Kurt (2020) was used depend on the literature review and a preliminary examination of the textbooks used in the mother tongue courses of different countries. The complete checklist consists of 9 themes and 62 items. For the purpose and scope of this research, an analysis was conducted within the framework of 3 themes and 28 items.

In Table 1, the themes and items in the textbook checklist and the CGO (Scope Validity Ratios) expressing the content validity of these items and the CGI (Content Validity Index) values of the themes that are given (Kurt, 2020).

Table 1. Textbook Assessment Checklist Theme and Item Content and Distribution of Related CGO and CGI Scores

Theme	Item	Statement	CGO	CGI
		Are there on the generics like; national anthem, flag, oath, state founder,	1	
General Content Features		eldest or national hero's official etc.?	1	
	2.	Does the book have usage information or organizational chart?	1	
	3.	3. Are the directions provided with infographics?4. Is there information about the learning objectives?		
	4.			
	5.	Is there a dictionary section?	1	1
	6.	Is there a directory partition?	1	1
	7.	Is there a resources section?	1	
	8.	Are there any additional resources, information, reminders section available?	1	
	9.	Are there any bibliographies of writers and poets?	1	
	10.	Is there a solutions section?	1	
	11.	Is it thematic?	1	
	12.	12. Is it generic?	1	
C1	13.	<u> </u>		
Classification Feature of	¹ 14.	Is it functional or functional?	1	1
	15.	Is it grammatical?	1	<u> </u>
Content	16. Is it ch	Is it chronological?	1	
	17.	7. Is it textual?	1	
	18.	Is the writer poet-based?	1	
	19. Are there differe	Are there different types of reading texts?	1	
	20.	Is there pre-reading or preparatory work?	1	
_	21. Are there	Are there any reading aids?	0.6	
Features of Language Skills and Learning Areas	22.	Are there different types of listening texts?	1	0.92
	23.	Are there different types of speaking exercises?	1	
	24.	Are there different types of writing exercises?	1	0.92
	25.	Is there information on spelling and punctuation rules?	1	
	26.	Are there any activities related to teaching vocabulary?	0.6	
	27.	Is there a theoretical explanation of grammar rules?	1	
	28.	Are there grammar activities?	1	

As it seen in Table 1, the checklist includes 28 items totally in 3 themes. The CGO values of the items are between .60 and 1.0; The Scale Content Validity Index (S-CVI) of the themes is between 0.92 and 1. If the Scope Validity Index of the scale is .80 or above, it is expressed as an acceptable value (Polit & Beck, 2006). Accordingly, the item CVIs in the textbook evaluation checklist are at an acceptable level.

Study Object

In determining the countries where the data will be collected, the success cases in the PISA report announced in 2015 were taken as the basis. Through purposeful sampling, European countries are divided into three categories as first, middle and last, according to the achievement scores in the field of "Reading Skills" of the report. Turkey as being in the last group, has been included to the field research directly where the choice is made randomly from the rest of the countries in the list. The aim here is not to establish a relationship between PISA reports and textbooks, but to choose the country in line with a certain standard. Accordingly, the countries that their coursebooks will be analyzed

have been identified as are; at the forefront Finland and Germany, in the middle Austria and Hungary, at the end Turkey and northern Macedonia.

In the next stage of the research, the textbooks used in the mentioned countries were determined. Due to the difficulty and cost of accessing mother tongue textbooks at all grade levels of secondary school and its equivalent, only mother tongue textbooks used for 6th grade and equivalent classes were taken as a sample. The websites of the countries' ministries of education or equivalent institutions and official education institutions were scanned and information was provided on the textbooks used. In determination studies it is seen that in Finland, Austria, Hungary, Turkey and Northern Macedonia the textbook selection is done centrally while there have been different applications according to the states in Germany. For this reason, the textbooks used in schools in the state where the capital Berlin is located in Germany were taken into consideration. In addition, after the books were acquired, it was learned that the books used in the state of Berlin are also valid for many regions.

Another situation identified in country reviews is that some countries use more than one official or mother tongue. The official languages in Finland are Finnish and Swedish. Swedish children are taught Finnish and the Finnish children are taught Swedish as a second mother tongue. There are also more than one language accepted as an official language in North Macedonia. These languages are Macedonian, Albanian, Turkish and Serbian. The choice of books in these countries is made according to the language mostly used. Therefore, the Finnish coursebook for Finland and Macedonian coursebook for North Macedonia became the document of the research.

In order to increase visibility in the interpretation of the findings in the study, a code was assigned to each textbook determined. The books that countries use in their mother tongue lessons and their codes in the research are given in Table 2.

Table 2. Textbooks and Codes Examined Within the Scope of the Research

Country	Name	English	Code
	Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus	Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature	F1
	Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja	Välkky 6 Mother Tongue Language and	F2
	Kirjallisuus Harjoituskirja	Literature Exercise Book	1.7
	Välkky 6 Harjoituskirja Ratkaisut	Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature	F3
Finland	varkky o Harjoituskiija Natkaisut	Exercise Book Solutions	1.3
	Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus	Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature	F4
	Kirjoitusvihko	Writing Handbook	1'4
	Välkky 6 S2 Äidinkielen ja	Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature	F5
	Kirjallisuus Suomi toisena kielenä	Second Language Finnish	1.3
	Deutschbuch 6 Sparch- und Lesebuch	German Book 6th Language and Reading	A1
Germany	Deutschbuch o Sparen- und Lesebuch	Book	А
	Deutschbuch 6 Arbeitsheft	German Book 6th Workbook	A2
	Treffpunkt Deutsch 2 Sprachbuch	Meeting Point German 2 Textbook	Av1
Austria	Treffpunkt Deutsch 2 Arbeitsheft	Meeting Point German 2 Workbook	Av2
Austra	Starke Seiten Deutsch 2 Schulbuch	Strong Pages German 2 Textbook	Av3
	Starke Seiten Deutsch 2 Arbeitsheft	Strong Pages German 2 Workbook	Av4

	Starke Seiten Deutsch 2 Grammatik und Rechtschreibung	Strong Pages German 2 Grammar and Spelling	Av5
	Sokszínű Magyar Nyelv 6 Tankönyv	Multicolor/Diverse Hungarian Language 6 Textbooks	M1
	Sokszínű Magyar Nyelv 6. Munkafüzet	Multicolored/Miscellaneous Hungarian Language 6 Workbook	M2
	Anyanyelv Felsősöknek 6. Tankönyv	Mother Tongue Tops (Secondary School) 6. Textbook	M3
Hungary	Anyanyelv Felsősöknek 6. Munkafüzet	Mother Tongue Upper (Secondary School) 6. Workbook	M4
	Sokszínű Írodalom 6. Tanköny	Multicolored/Various Literature 6. Textbook	M5
	Sokszínű Írodalom 6 Munkafüzet	Multicolored/Various Literature 6 Workbooks	M6
	Nyelvtan, Helyesírás, Fogalmazás 6. Tankönyv	Grammar, Spelling, Composition Textbook	M7
	Nyelvtan, Helyesírás, Fogalmazás 6. Munkafüzet	Grammar, Spelling, Composition Workbook	M8
	Nyelvtan, Helyesírás, Fogalmazás Feladatgyűjtemény 6.	Grammar, Spelling, Composition Exercise Book	M9
Turkey	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Türkçe Ders Kitabı 6.	Middle School and Preacher Middle School Turkish Textbook 6th Grade	T1
Northern Macedonia	Учебник по македонски јазик за VI одделение	VI. Macedonian Textbook for Class	KM1

As shown in Table 2 in the study from Finland 5, Germany 2, 5 from Austria, Hungary 9, a total of 23 books were examined, including one from Turkey and Northern Macedonia.

Data Analysis

The evaluation of the textbooks according to the checklist was made by the researcher and three field experts, who are competent language users in the languages of the textbooks. The reliability of the evaluations made independently was analyzed according to the reliability formula proposed by Miles and Huberman (1994) based on the principle of consensus and dissent, and the reliability of the evaluations was calculated as 87%. The fact that Miles-Huberman's reliability formula application result exceeds 70% means that the research is reliable. The items with disagreement were discussed by the evaluators and consensus was achieved as presented in the findings section.

Results

General Content View

The general view of the content features of the mother tongue textbooks of the countries is given in Table 3.

Tablo 3. General Outlook of the Content Features of the Textbooks

General Content Features	Books	f	%
National Elements in Generic	T1	1	4,3
Usage information of his book / Organization chart	A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5,	9	39
	M5, T1		
Infographics	A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5,	13	56,5
	F1, F2, F5, M3, M5, M7		
Information about learning goals	-	0	0
Dictionary section	M1, M3, M5, M7, KM1	5	21,7
Directory section	A1, A2, Av1, Av3, KM1	5	21,7
Resources section	A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5,	10	43,4
	M6, T1, KM1		
Additional resource, information, reminder section	A1, Av1, Av3, M5	4	17,3
available			
Writers and Poets bibliography	M5, KM1	2	8,7
Event Solutions Division	F3, F4, A1, A2, Av3, Av4, Av5	7	30,4

The first content feature given in Table 3 is the status of the data on national elements in the generic part of the textbooks. According to this, it is seen that national elements such as the national anthem, flag, oath, the state founder, the elder or the national hero are not included in any books except Turkish textbook.

According to the second column, which reveals whether there is a section on the organization chart or usage information of mother tongue textbooks, it was determined that none of the mother language textbooks in Finland did not include an organizational chart. There is a comprehensive organizational chart supported by infographics in the introduction part of the textbooks in Germany and Austria. Among the mother tongue textbooks of Hungary, only a little information is provided about the use of the literature book, while there is no usage information or organization chart in other books. Another book that has an organizational chart is the Turkish textbook in Turkey. The organization chart or usage information is not included in the book of the mother tongue of North Macedonia.

Looking at the third row of Table 3, which shows the use of infographic for orientation in the textbooks, it is seen that among the mother tongue textbooks in Finland, infographics are included in Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus [Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature], while the exercise book (Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus Harjoituskirja [Välkky 6 Mother Language and Literature Exercise Book]) and the same second language Finnish book (Välkky 6 S2 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus Suomi Toisena Kielenä [Välkky 6 Mother Language and Literature Second Language Finnish) a few instruction visuals are included but these elements are not used in other books . It is seen that instructional infographics are used in German books in Germany and Austria. Infographics for instruction are not included in most of the mother tongue textbooks in Hungary. The only book in which the mother tongue and infographics that have a small place in the literature book were used fully was the grammar, spelling and composition textbook. Except the activity number on a standard

figure, it is confirmed that instruction infographics are not included in mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and Northern Macedonia

In the fourth row of Table 3, the answers to the question of whether the learning objectives are included in the chapter, theme or unit entries of the textbooks are shown. Accordingly, this data was not found in any book within the scope of the research.

Looking at the line of the table reveals if there is the part of glossary in the textbook or not, in the textbooks in Finland, Germany, Austria and Turkey it is seen that there is no such partitioning. While mother tongue books in Hungary have a dictionary section in textbooks but there is no dictionary in study or activity books. Whereas there is a dictionary section in North Macedonian books.

As shown in the sixth row of Table 3 In the mother tongue textbooks in Finland, Hungary and Turkey, directory section is not included. However, in two books in Germany and Austria and in the textbook in North Macedonia index section is included.

According to the seventh line of Table 3, which reveals the existence of the resources section in the textbooks, the resources section is not included in the textbooks in Finland. Germany, Austria, Turkey and Northern Macedonia textbooks resources section while only literary books among the main language books in Hungary (Sokszínű Irodalom 6 Tanköny [Multi Color / Miscellaneous Literature 6. Textbook]) sources indicated.

Another section in the textbooks is the supplementary section that includes elements such as information, reminder, evaluation, and example. According to the eighth row of Table 3 additional sections illustrating the use of textbooks in the countries Finland, Turkey and Northern Macedonia this section does not exist. There are additional information sections in German and Austrian textbooks and in Hungary's literature book.

As it can be seen in the ninth line of Table 3, which reveals the existence of information about the authors and poets of the works included only in the Hungarian literature textbook and the bibliography information included towards the last pages of the textbook in North Macedonia.

Another information shown in Table 3 is about the existence of the solution section that includes the solutions of the activities in the books. Accordingly, solutions are included in all of the German and Austrian books. Among the books in Finland is the solutions section of Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus Kirjoitusvihko [Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature Writing Booklet]. Also, one of the five books in Finland is a book of solutions in itself (Välkky 6 Harjoituskirja Ratkaisut [Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature Exercise Book Solutions]). It was observed that the solutions of the activities in the themes were not included in the Turkish coursebook. In the books

in Hungary and North Macedonia, there is no section regarding the activities and solving the questions in the book.

Content Segmentation

Another issue that is examined about the content in the textbooks is how the compartments are made. The view regarding this is given in Table 4.

Table 4. Compartmentalization of Textbooks

Type of segmentation	Condition	Book	f	%
Thematic	Yes	F1, A1, Av1, Av3 M1, M2, T1, KM1	8	34,7
Thematic	Partially	-	0	0
Textual	Yes	-	0	0
Textual	Partially	-	0	0
Skill Based	Yes	F2, F5	2	8,7
Skiii based	Partially	F1, A1, A2	3	13
Eurotional/Operational	Yes	-	0	0
Functional/Operational	Partially	F1, A1, A2, Av3, Av4, Av5, M3, M4, M7, M8, M9	11	47,8
	Yes	Av2	1	4,3
Grammatical	Partially	A2, Av1, Av3, Av4, Av5, M1, M2, M3, M4, M7, M8, M9	12	52
Changlagiagl	Yes	-	0	0
Chronological	Partially	-	0	0
Varietal	Yes	F3, M5, M6	3	13
v arretar	Partially	-	0	0
Author-Poet based	Yes	-	0	0
Author-Poet based	Partially	-	0	0

According to Table 4, partitioning of textbooks is done in different ways. In the basic structures of the books, thematic (f=8) division feature was preferred most. Textual, chronological and author-poet-based segmentation structure has not been used in any book. There are 3 books that are generic in basic structure, 2 books that are skill-based and 1 book is grammatical. Functional / functional (f=11) and grammatical (f=12) segmentation features are preferred as infrastructure.

When the segmentation features are analyzed in terms of countries, it is seen that different methods are used in the content segmentation of the mother tongue textbooks in Finland. It is possible to divide the mother tongue and literature book (Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus [Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature]) into two parts. The first part is completely thematic. The second part is skill-based and functional. There is compartmentalization integrity in other books in Finland. Two books (Välkky 6 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus Harjoituskirja [Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature Practice Book], Välkky 6 S2 Äidinkielen ja Kirjallisuus Suomi Toisena Kielenä [Välkky 6 Mother Language and Literature Second Language Finny]) ja Kirjallisuus Kirjoitusvihko [Välkky 6 Mother Tongue and Literature Writing Booklet]) is also created with generic division. A grammatical division is not found in Finnish books.

There are also different partitioning features in the textbooks in Germany. The general chapters of the textbook (Deutschbuch 6 Sparch- und Lesebuch [German Book 6. Language and

Reading Book]) are thematic. However, the departments are divided into sub-sections and these sections are formed according to language skills or functional.

The partitioning features of the German workbook in Germany (Deutschbuch 6 Arbeitsheft [German Book 6 Workbook]) also shows differences. The main structure of the book is arranged according to language skills and function. However, grammatical structures in the chapters also draw attention.

There are also different partitioning features in mother tongue textbooks in Austria (Treffpunkt Deutsch 2 Sprachbuch [Meeting Point German 2 Textbook], Starke Seiten Deutsch 2 Schulbuch [Strong Pages German 2 Textbook]). The first of the textbooks is thematic in general. However, it has a grammatical structure, albeit partially. Subtitling is based on language skills. The other textbook, Starke Seiten Deutsch 2 Schulbuch [Strong Pages German 2 Textbook] is functional in general, as can be seen from the organizational chart before, but it shows partially thematic and grammatical division features. The content segmentation of the workbooks is grammatically and functionally designed.

Mother tongue textbooks in Hungary also have different segmentation features. Hungarian language textbooks and workbooks (Sokszínű Magyar Nyelv 6 Tankönyv [Multicolored/Various Hungarian Language 6 Textbooks], Sokszínű Magyar Nyelv 6. Munkafüzet [Multicolored/Miscellaneous Hungarian Language 6 Workbook]) are thematically formed while literature textbooks and workbooks (Sokszínű Irodalom 6. Tanköny [Multicolored/Various Literature 6. Textbook], Sokszínű Írodalom 6 Munkafüzet [Multicolored/Various Literature 6 Workbook]) are generic. There is a functional and grammatical compartmentalization structure in mother tongue course and workbooks, as well as in essay and spelling books.

Content segmentation is made in Turkey and Northern Macedonia thematically. The themes in the Turkish textbook are nature and the universe, national struggle and Atatürk, the world of children, virtues, our national culture, science and technology, art and citizenship. The theme names used in content segmentation in North Macedonia are; language, literature, learning types, education and training, media culture, information technologies.

Language Skills and Learning Areas in Textbooks

The situations where countries include language skills and learning fields in their mother tongue textbooks are shown in Table 5.

Table 5. Language Skills and Learning Areas in Textbooks

Language Skills and Learning Areas	Condition	Book	f	%
D. H. T.	Yes	F1, F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av3, M1, M2, M3, M4, M5, M6, M7, M8, M9, T1, KM1	18	78
Reading Texts	Partially	Av2, Av4, Av5	3	13
	No	F2, F3	2	8,7
	Yes	F1, F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av3, M1, M5, T1, KM1	11	47,8
Pre-reading or	Partially	-	0	0
preparatory work	No	F2, F3 Av2, Av4, Av5, M2, M3, M4, M6, M7, M8, M9	12	52
	Yes	A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5, M5	8	34,7
Reading Aids	Partially	-	0	0
Reading Mas	No F1, F2, F2, F3 F5, M1, M2, M3, M4, M6, M7, M8, M9, T1, KM1 Yes F1, F2, F5, A1, Av1, Av3, M1, M2, M5, T1 Partially - F3, F4, A2, Av2, Av4, Av5, M3, M4, M6, M7, M8, M9, KM1 Yes F1, F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av3, M1, M2, M5, T1, KM1 dies Partially -	15	65,2	
	Yes	F1, F2, F5, A1, Av1, Av3, M1, M2, M5, T1	10	43,4
Listening Texts	Partially	-		0
Listening Texts	No		13	56,5
	Yes	F1, F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av3, M1, M2, M5, T1, KM1	12	52
Speaking Studies	•	-	0	
-	No	F3, F4, Av2, Av4, Av5, M3, M4, M6, M7, M8, M9	11	47,8
Writing Studies	Yes	F1, F2, F4, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5, M1, M2, M6, M7, M8, M9, T1, KM1	19	82,6
writing Studies	Partially	-	0	0
	No	F3, M3, M4, M5	4	17,3
Knowledge of spelling and	Yes	F1, F4, A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5, M1, M2, M7, M8, M9, T1, KM1	16	69,5
punctuation rules	Partially	F2, F5	2	8,7
	No	F3, M3, M4, M5, M6	5	21
Vocabulary	Yes	F1, F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av3, Av4, Av5, M1, M2, M3, M4, M5, M6, T1, KM1	17	73,9
Teaching	Partially	Av2	1	4,3
•	No	F3, F4, M7, M8, M9	5	21
Explanation of	Yes	F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5, M1, M2, M3, M4, M7, M8, M9, KM1	17	73,9
grammar rules	Partially	F1, T1	2	8,7
	No	F3, F4, M5, M6	4	17,3
Grammar	Yes	F2, F5, A1, A2, Av1, Av2, Av3, Av4, Av5, M1, M2, M3, M4, M7, M8, M9, KM1	17	73,9
Activities	Partially	F1, T1	2	8,7
1100 1100	No	F3, F4, M5, M6	4	17,3
-				

According to Table 5, it is seen that reading texts, which are the basic material of mother tongue education, are included in all textbooks of Finland except for two textbooks. When the presence of pre-reading and preparation studies investigated Finland, Germany, Austria, Turkey and part of the preparation in reading books with text in northern Macedonia are also in evidence. It has been observed that while reading text is available in most of the books in Hungary, the preparation section is not included.

According to the third column of Table 5, which reveals whether auxiliary elements are used in reading texts, line or verse numbers are indicated in all of the reading texts in the textbooks of Germany and Austria (Figure 1). Numbering is also used in the Hungarian literature book, in addition,

the meanings of the words in the texts are explained on the margins (Figure 2). Similar items are not included in the textbooks of other countries.

> Der Hund am Wegrand "Hier auf dieser Straße ist es passiert, dort vor-

Barbara Büchne

2 ne an der Kreuzung, wo der Wegweiser steht", 46 Hund. Ein ziemlich großer, dunkelbrauner Kerl 4 vierleiter des Gendarmeriepostens von Kreut- 45 ein Boxermischling oder etwas Ähnliches gewe zenwald. "Und ich weiß genau, dass ich mich sen sein. Und erzählen Sie mir jetzt nicht, ich 6 nicht getäuscht habe. Es war eine klare, mond- 50 hätte einen Baumstrunk oder den Schatten eihelle Nacht, und außerdem hatte ich natürlich unes Busches für einen Hund gehalten! Ich fuhr « die Scheinwerfer an.

von Anfang an, Doktor."

- Der Tierarzt nickte. "In Ordnung." Er schal- zu primiert aus. Sie wissen ja, wie Hunde aussehen, tete zurück und fuhr langsamer, obwohl die wenn sie alle Hoffnung aufgegeben haben.* 4 Landstraße um diese Nachtzeit nur selten be- 48
- fahren wurde. Der Fernverkehr lief über die

- Ihnen, ich habe mich nicht getäuscht: Da lag ein
- sagte der Tierarzt zu seinem Beifahrer, dem Re- mit einer faltigen Schlabberschnauze muss
- sa keine sechzig Stundenkilometer, und ich hatte Der Gendarm machte eine unbestimmte ihn voll im Scheinwerserlicht. Er lag flach auf « Geste. "Erzählen Sie mir die Geschichte doch 44 dem Boden, die Schnauze auf den Vorderpfoten, und sah schrecklich erschöpft und de-

 - "Ja, sieht jämmerlich aus", bestätigte der Gendarm.

Figure 1. Sentence Numbering as an Auxiliary to Reading Texts in the German Textbook in Austria

25 érkeznék - tudna, birna 26 szurdék • itt: a kemence és a fal közötti szűk hely; másképpen kuckó vagy sut 27 búsuljen a lovad, elég nagy a feie . szólás; jelertése: nem érdemes búslakodni

126.3. kép + IZSÓ Miklós: Táncoló paraszt. A szobrászt a néptánc ragadta meg, így keletkezett 15 szoborból álló sorozata



- 17. Bence a tarisznyát béhozá ezalatt: Miklósnak ugyancsak jólesett a falat, Rakta is szaporán, alig győzte nyelni, Három sem érkeznék25 vele versent enni. Mikor pedig a nagy kanna megérkezett, Mint a birkozásnak, nekigyűrekezett; Felhajtá majd félig az öt pintes pohárt; Bence megsokalta: "Az Istenért! megárt."
- 18. "Árt, nem árt, én azzal keveset gondolok, Terád pedig kicsit tartozik a dolog; Ha örül az ember, csak nyűg, hogy van esze; Temessük el azt ma, itt van, igyál, nesze!" Avval odaadta az edényt Bencének: Reszketett a keze az öreg legénynek, Nem is bátorkodott inni egyszer sokat; Mindig megolvasta titkon a kortyokat.
- 19. Míg ezek történtek a felső asztalon, A kemencénél megpendült a cimbalom:

Figure 2. Use of Page Borders as an ancillary for Reading Texts in Textbooks in Hungary

Considering the presence of listening texts in the mother tongue textbooks of the countries, it is seen that at least one book of other countries, except for the textbook in North Macedonia, includes listening texts.

One of the information given in Table 5 is about whether there are studies on writing skills in the textbooks or not. Accordingly, writing activities were included even in one of the textbooks in the countries covered by the research. While writing studies are included in all of the books in Germany and Austria, different books have been designed for this skill of mother tongue education in Finland and Hungary.

According to the seventh column of Table 5, which expresses the existence of spelling and punctuation rules in the textbooks at the level of knowledge, it is seen that the rule information is also included in parallel with the existence of writing practice.

According to the eighth column in Table 5, which shows the status of vocabulary teaching, which is an important part of language education and considered as an integrated skill, in the textbooks, there are activities related to word teaching in all of the textbooks. Vocabulary teaching is not included only in the solution book and writing book in Finland and in the grammar writing and composition set in Hungary.

Do not include theoretical knowledge and practice about the grammar rules of textbooks showing the situation as shown in Table 5 in the last two columns, there are few data on knowledge of the language in textbooks in Finland and Turkey. Apart from these, grammar rules and examples are important units in the textbooks in Germany, Austria, Hungary and North Macedonia.

Discussion, Conclusion and Recommendations

Before presenting the results based on the findings of the research, it is necessary to mention the "textbook diversity" that is determined during the data and source selection process and affects the findings significantly. The six countries covered by the research use textbooks in different numbers and contents in mother tongue education. The country with the highest variety of textbooks is Hungary with 9 different textbooks, 5 in Finland and Austria, 2 in Germany, in Turkey and Northern Macedonia there is just one book for each. Textbooks are the heart of the curriculum (Sheldon, 1988) or the visible face of the curriculum in the educational setting. Accordingly, it provides information about the number and variety of mother tongue textbooks, the content and density of the countries' mother tongue curriculum. Data and resource selection based on these findings, shows that the diversity of the textbooks used in Turkish courses in Turkey is less and the curriculum is narrow. The most important difference in the variety of textbooks in Hungary and partially Finland has been the literature textbooks, which are named as literature and created on the basis of text type. This situation shows that the literature lesson or its subjects are in the curriculum of secondary schools and that students have started to be equipped with the knowledge and taste of literature in the middle school. Considering that this is an initial degree, the idea that these countries' literature subjects in secondary education will be more detailed than in other countries arises. In particular, systematic presentation of genres such as fairy tales, epics, legends and poems that are fed by national elements will contribute to students' identity development and will enable them to grow up with national consciousness and self-values. Based on this result, starting from secondary schools, the Turkish course should be transformed into Turkish language and literature course, and the curriculum and textbook should be prepared accordingly. The mother tongue education curriculum and textbooks in Hungary serve as an example.

The first conclusion based on the findings of the research is that the textbooks examined have significant differences in terms of content features. In no country other than Turkey in the generic part of the main language textbooks, anthem, flag are not placed as a significant value. The Turkish textbook includes the Turkish flag, the Turkish National Anthem, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk's official and his address to the youth. In this respect, Turkish textbooks set an example for the textbooks of other countries.

One of the content elements of the textbooks is the organizational chart. This part of the book is the user manual, are found in Germany, Austria and Turkey textbooks. It is included in a few textbooks in Finland and Hungary. Especially in Germany and Austria, the organizational chart in the mother tongue books is seen as very successful and effective in terms of guiding teachers and students. Which skills the activity supports, the difficulty levels of the tasks and tasks, what the symbols mean are clearly explained here. Just creating this structure is proof of how much the publisher has focused on the textbook. There is an impression that students will need to look at this section until they get used to the infographics defined in the organizational chart. There is an organization chart in the Turkish textbook, but unlike the books in Germany and Austria, it is not in a structure that will be felt inadequate even if it is not looked at by students. In addition, organizational chart is a need for books supported by infographics. There is almost no infographic in the Turkish textbook. This situation also reduces the need for organization chart.

In all German textbooks in Germany and Austria, guidance was provided with infographics. There is almost no non-infographic activity, text, work. The students' decision of what a study is about is not left to chance. Some of the mother tongue textbooks in Finland and Hungary have infographic for orientation purposes. These elements are not included in Turkish and Macedonian textbooks. According to Mizerska (2015), visuality is a requirement of modern education. People are designed for visual perception and 70% of their buyers are about seeing (Mizerska, 2015: 212). The absence of visual infographics in the textbooks is not suitable for both the nature of today's children and the modern understanding of education.

There is no information about learning outcomes before the chapter, unit or text in any book within the scope of the study. However, the goals determined according to Locke provide higher performance regardless of the higher the difficulty levels (as cited in Yavuz, 2006). In this sense, students should be made aware of the purpose of the unit, theme or topic, and the acquisitions should be presented to the students in an appropriate language.

Glossary given in textbooks to Hungary and Macedonia in northern Turkey, Finland, Germany and Austria are not included in the books. The absence of a dictionary section in the Turkish coursebook can be explained by the Turkish course curricula published in 2006 and 2019. With the Turkish Lesson Curriculum of 2006, the method of using dictionary has changed. With this new

program prepared with a constructivist education approach, learning the meanings of some words that were not known from the text as in the past from the dictionary behind the book was ended (Erbil & Yıldız, 2013). In the last program (MEB, 2019), "Predicts the meaning of words and word groups he does not know by using the context." "Visuals, dictionary, proverbs and idioms dictionary etc. to learn the words and word groups that students guess." they are allowed to use the tools. " Explanation explains the reason why the dictionary, which is a material in itself, is not given at the end of the textbook in order to ensure its use by students.

The existence of the index section, which is a unit similar to dictionary, in the textbooks also differs. This section is included in textbooks other than books in Germany and North Macedonia and books of activity or study type in Austria. Finland, the main language in Turkey and Hungary is such section in the textbooks.

The list of sources used in the creation of textbooks in Germany, Austria, Turkey and Northern Macedonia, and only seen in literature textbooks in Hungary while there was no data in the books in Finland.

One of the units included in the content of textbooks is usually the supplementary section where more information or examples are presented. Among the textbooks examined, this section was included only in the textbooks in Germany and Austria. In these books, it is stated with infographics that there is additional information on the subject in the pages and students are directed to the appendix.

There are only a few textbooks in which biographies are available for authors and poets. Biographies are included in the last parts of the literature textbook in Hungary and the Macedonian textbook in North Macedonia. In other countries and especially in Turkey there is no biography in the textbooks. However, it was stated that the biographies of writers and poets should be included in the 14-item list explaining how Turkish textbooks should be in the Turkish Course Curriculum (MEB, 2019).

The solutions section, where students can check their answers to the activities, is available in all mother tongue textbooks in Germany and Austria and two books in Finland. However, one of the books in Finland is the solutions book in itself. In Hungary, Turkey and Northern Macedonia the solution of the events and questions are not included in the textbooks. This situation increases the dependency of the course and textbooks to the teacher and does not allow students to control their own learning.

Another feature that is controlled in the textbooks in terms of content features is how the books are divided. Accordingly, most of the mother tongue textbooks are prepared in multiple

structures. The most preferred structure in basic content segmentation is the thematic structure. This is followed by generic and skill-based segmentation features. Under these basic segmentation structures, it is seen that functional / operational and grammatical segmentation features dominate the content of the textbooks. Three structures should be emphasized here in particular: thematic, functional / operational and grammatical structure. Thematic structure has become important in learning with the constructivist approach. According to Yaylı (2020), with the thematic structure, activating the preliminary information, associating with the next information, processing and structuring the information becomes easier. Thus, students are provided with the opportunity to expand, organize, construct in their minds and transfer their acquired knowledge and skills to daily life (Günes, 2008). The thematic division of mother tongue textbooks in different countries shows that they adopt a constructivist approach. Functional / operational structure is the reflection of task-based language teaching method on textbooks. In this structure, the presentation-practice-production cycle constitutes the basic framework of teaching (Willis as cited in 1996 by Yaylı, 2006). Functional / operational structure, with this feature, enables the thematic structure to be completed and to enter a functional and communicative process. The functional / operational structure, which is preferred as subdivision in mother tongue books of Germany, Austria, Finland and Hungary, provides the basis for students to learn by doing and living systematically.

One of the preferred types of compartmentalisation in textbooks is grammatical segmentation. In this structure, which is used as both basic and subdivision in the textbooks of Austria and as subdivision in the textbooks of Germany and Hungary, grammar rules are studied theoretically and practically. Grammar teaching is the process of creating language awareness by transforming students' implicit knowledge of language into explicit knowledge and the ability to use language consciously (Çelikpazu, 2015). Despite this importance, the place of grammar teaching in Turkish teaching is discussed. Today, the emphasis is on understanding and explaining in Turkish lessons, grammar has taken its place as an auxiliary field of study and has ceased to be an aim in Turkish teaching (Karagöz & Oryaşın, 2014). The use of grammatical segmentation that includes rules and activities in the textbooks of Germany, Austria and Hungary shows that these countries attach importance to grammar teaching in mother tongue education. The grammatical structure in the books of these countries can be taken as an example in the preparation of Turkish textbooks.

When textbooks partitioned status to countries with a special look at one book of textbooks in Turkey and Northern Macedonia it is seen only as thematic segmentation. There is no certain standard in the partitioning features of the textbooks in Finland and they differ according to the type of book. While the textbooks in Germany and Austria have different segmentation features, the books have been subjected to a grammatical classification in one aspect. In Hungary, which is the country with the highest book diversity, a standard segmentation structure has not been used, but generally functional and linguistic classification has been adopted.

When textbooks are evaluated within the framework of language skills and learning areas, it is seen that reading texts are included in almost all books. There are no reading texts only in the solutions book and writing booklet in Finland. Inclusion of pre-reading and preparatory work is also a feature encountered in most of the books. It is seen that only in the reading texts in the Hungarian books, the pre-study or preparation part is less included. Two situations were encountered in textbooks as a reading aid. These are the numbering of lines or strings and the numbering of the unknown word and placing it in the margin closest to its place in the text. The first is found in textbooks in Germany and Austria, and the second in the Hungarian literature book.

Listening texts are included in at least one book of all countries except North Macedonia. Speaking studies are included in at least one book of all countries.

Another feature that all countries have partnered with has been in writing activities. In all countries and in most of the textbooks, both writing exercises and knowledge of spelling and punctuation rules are included.

Part of mother tongue education is vocabulary teaching. In this respect, it is seen that the textbooks are prepared accordingly and most of them include activities related to vocabulary teaching.

One of the topics discussed in language teaching has been on grammar. As mentioned above, questions such as should it be taught or how it should be taught are frequently discussed in our country. It is seen that this is reflected in Turkish textbooks. Explanations and examples of grammar rules are partially included in Turkish books. However, grammar rules and activities are included in almost all the books of other countries.

Six countries were examined in this study, which systematically reveals the content characteristics of mother tongue textbooks in different countries. The textbooks of important countries such as France, England, Spain, Italy and Russia should also be examined systematically, the most ideal content features should be revealed and Turkish textbooks should be prepared in this manner.

References

- Açık Önkaş, N., & Günay, E. (2015). Ders kitabı inceleme ölçütlerine göre Türkçe ders kitaplarının karşılaştırılması. İnternational Journal of Languages Education and Teaching, 3(3), 365-378. DOI:10.18298/ijlet.513
- Arı, G. (2011). Türkçe (6, 7, 8. Sınıf) ders kitaplarındaki okuma ve dinleme/ izleme metinleri ile yazma görevleri arasındaki tür uyumu. *Turkish Studies International Periodical for The Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic, 6*(3), 489-511. DOI:10.7827/TurkishStudies.2375
- Arif, A. (2008). *Minority policy of the republic of Macedonia and its effect on education* [Unpublished Master's Thesis]. Yıldız Technical University.
- Aytaçlı, B. (2020). German education systems. In A. Türkoğlu (Eds.), *Comparative Education with Examples from World Countries* (pp.13-36). Anı Yayıncılık.

- Berg, H. (2017). Kulttuurinen moninaisuus perusopetuksen suomi toisena kielenä -oppikirjoissa (Erityispedagogiikan pro gradu -tutkielma). Jyväskylän yliopisto.
- Çakır, P. (2013). Türkçe ders kitaplarındaki öykülerin çocuğa görelik ilkesi açısından incelenmesi. *Turkish Studies- International Periodical for The Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*, 8(1), 1171-1180.
- Caner, M., & Kurt, B. (2020). Textbook evaluation approaches, ZfWT, 12 (1), 365 382.
- Çelik, A., & Caner, M. (2020). The communicative competence elements in the foreign language textbooks: A descriptive case study on Turkish and English textbooks. *IARTEM E-Journal*, 12(1). DOI:10.21344/iartem.v12i1.727
- Çelikpazu, E. E. (2015). Secondary school 5-8. A study on classroom Turkish grammar teaching. *Turkish Studies*, 10 (15), 333-360. DOI:10.7827/TurkishStudies.8926
- Cömert Bayraktar, Ö. (2017). 2017 Türkçe dersi öğretim programında yer alan ortaokul düzeyindeki (5, 6, 7 ve 8. sınıflar) konuşma becerisi kazanımlarına yönelik bir çalışma. *Bartın Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi.* 6(3), 1331-1344. DOI:10.14686/buefad.344547
- Coskun, H., & Ciftci, O. (2019). Investigation of tales in turkish textbooks in terms of conveying values. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 15(3), 156-168. DOI: 10.29329/ijpe.2019.193.11
- Demir, Y., & Ertaş, A. (2014). A Suggested eclectic checklist for elt coursebook evaluation. *The Reading Matrix*, 14 (2), p. 243-252.
- Deniz, K., Tarakcı, R., & Karagöl, E. (2019b). Okuma kazanımları açısından ortaokul Türkçe ders kitapları. *Ana Dili Egitimi Dergisi*, 7(3), 688-708., DOI: 10.16916/aded.569153
- Deniz, K., Tarakcı, R., Karagöl, E. (2019a). Dinleme/izleme kazanımları açısından ortaokul Türkçe ders kitapları. *Avrasya Dil Eğitimi ve Araştırmaları Dergisi, 3* (1), 18-32.
- Durmuşçelebi, M. (2007). Turkey and mother tongue teaching in primary schools in Germany-training programs and course books in terms of a comparison [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Ankara University.
- Elbir, B. & Yıldız, H. (2013). Dictionary use and lexicography in Turkish teaching. *Adıyaman University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, (11), 249 268.
- Epçaçan, C., & Okçu, V. (2010). İlköğretim Türkçe ders kitaplarının öğretmen görüşleri doğrultusunda değerlendirilmesi. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 40 (187), 39-51.
- Erbaş, A. K., Alacacı, C. & Bulut, M. (2012). A comparison of Turkish, Singapore and American mathematics textbooks. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice*, 12 (3), 2311-2330.
- Esen, Y. (2003). School information and textbooks. In M. T. Bound and Y. Esen (Eds.), *Human Rights in Textbooks: For Textbooks Sensitive to Human Rights* (pp.5-20). History Foundation Publications.
- Finlex (2018). *Oppivelvollisille annettavan perusopetuksen tuntijako*. Retrieved from https://www.finlex.fi/fi/laki/alkup/2018/20180793.
- Fitzgerald, F. (1979). America Revised: History Schoolbooks in The Twentieth Century. Vintage Press.
- Garinger, D. (2002). Textbook selection for the efl classroom. *Center for Applied Linguistics Digest*. ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED-99-Co-0008.

- Gósy, M. (2005). Pszicholingvisztika. Osiris Kiadó.
- Graves, K. (2000). Designing language courses. Newbury House.
- Gün, M. (2013). İlköğretim ikinci kademe Türkçe dersi okuma etkinliklerinde öğrenme ortamları ile kullanılan araç-gereçlerin yeterliliği. *Tarih Okulu Dergisi* (15), 545-567.
- Güneş, F. (2008). New Approaches in Turkish Teaching. *Turkish Teaching Congress*. Bahçeşehir University.
- Häkkinen, K. (2002). Suomalaisen oppikirjan vaiheita. Suomen tietokir-jailijat ry.
- İşeri, K. (2007). Altıncı sınıf Türkçe ders kitabının ilköğretim Türkçe programının amaçlarına uygunluğunun değerlendirilmesi. *Dil Dergisi* (136), 58-74.
- Kadızade, D. E., & Önder, B. (2016). İlköğretim Türkçe programı ile Türkçe çalışma kitaplarındaki kazanım ve etkinliklerin konuşma becerisi açısından değerlendirilmesi. *Eğitimde Kuram ve Uygulama*, 12(5), 1104-1124.
- Kalmus, V. (2004). What do pupils and textbooks do with each other?: Methodological problems of research on socialization through educational media. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, *36* (3), 469-485.
- Karababa, Z. C. (2005). Avrupa'da anadili öğretimi Türkçe ve İngilizce anadili ders kitaplarının incelenmesi ve karşılaştırılması (Kuzey İrlanda, İskoçya ve İngiltere örneği). *Millî Eğitim*,167. Retrieved from http://dhgm.meb.gov.tr/yayimlar/dergiler/ Milli_Egitim_Dergisi/167/index3-karababa.htm
- Karagöl, E, & Tarakcı, R. (2018). Yazma becerisi kazanımları açısından ortaokul Türkçe ders kitapları. International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, 6(4), 87-100. DOI:10.18298/ijlet.3180
- Karagöz, M. & Oryaşın, U. (2014). The relationship between grammar activities in Turkish textbooks and texts. *Journal of Education and Training Research*, 3 (2), 187-194.
- Kılıç, A & Seven. S. (2006), Subject area textbook review. Pegem A Yayıncılık.
- Kurt, B. (2018). Ana dili eğitiminde kullanılan ders kitapları üzerine bir karşılaştırma: Türkiye ve Macaristan örneği. *Anadolu Uluslararası Multidisipliner Kongresi Bildiriler*, 1170-1181.
- Kurt, B. (2020). An example of a checklist for the evaluation of language education textbooks. *IV. International Turkish World Social Sciences Symposium Proceedings*, 145-153. Retrieved from http://www.weltdertuerken.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/ytmk.pdf
- Kurt, B., & Demir, N. (2019). Türkiye, Avusturya ve Macaristan'daki ana dili ders kitaplarında teknoloji kullanımı üzerine bir değerlendirme, *International European Conference on Interdisciplinary Scientific Researches*, 148-157.
- Laspina, J. A. (2009). The visual turn and transformation of the textbook. Routledge.
- Lüle Mert, E. (2011). 8. sınıf Türkçe ders kitaplarındaki metinlerin metinsellik ölçütlerine uygunlukları. Dil Dergisi, (153), 7-23.
- MEB (2016). *Ministry of national education, textbooks and educational tools regulation*. Retrieved from http://ttkb.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2016_01/12113913_yonetmelik derskitaplari.pdf.

- MEB. (2019). *Turkish Course Curriculum (Primary and Secondary Schools 1,2,3,4,5,6,7 and 8th Grades)*. Ministry of National Education.
- Memduhoğlu, H. B. (2015). Austrian education system. In A. Balcı (Eds.), *Comparative Education Systems* (pp.67-90). Pegem A Yayıncılık.
- Miles, M, B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). Qualitative data analysis: An expanded Sourcebook. Sage.
- Mizerska, M. (2015). Visual literacy. *The book of trends in education 2.0*. Young Digital Sa Sanoma Company. Retrieved from https://www.ydp.eu/assets/pdf/The-Book-of-Trends-in-Education-2.0-YDP.pdf.
- Mukundan, J., Hajimohammadi, R., & Nimehchisalem, V. (2011). Developing an English language textbook evaluation checklist. *Contemporary Issues in Education Research*, 4 (6), 21-28.
- Nuffic (2015). *Education system Germany described and compared with the Dutch system*. Retrieved from https://www.nuffic.nl/en/publications/education-system-germany
- Oğuzkan, F. (1993). Educational terms dictionary. Emel Matbaacılık.
- Petróczi, G. (2020). *A Nemzeti alaptanterv 2020*. Retrieved from évi módosításából adódó feladatok www.petroczigabor.hucikkekigazgato_kollegaknakmodositott_nat_bevezetese.html.
- Pingel, F. (2010). *Unesco Guidebook on textbook research and textbook revision 2nd revised and updated edition.* UNESCO.
- Polit, D. F., & Beck, C. T. (2006). The content validity index: are you sure you know what's being reported? critiqueand recommendations. *Research in Nursing & Health*, 29, 489-497.
- RIS (2018). Lehrplan der neuen mittelschule. Retrieved from https://www.ris.bka.gv.at/ NormDokument.wxe?Abfrage=Bundesnormen&Gesetzesnummer=20009944&FassungVom=2 018-09-05&Artikel=&Paragraf=135&Anlage=&Uebergangsrecht=
- Şentürk, L., & Aktaş, E. (2015). Türkiye'de ve Romanya'da okutulan ana dili Türkçe ders kitaplarının değer iletimi açısından karşılaştırılması. *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi*, *13*(29), 215-243.
- SGM (2017). *Türk eğitim sistemleri*, Retrieved from http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/eurydice/kitaplar/Turk_Egitim_Sistemi_2017/TES_2017.pdf
- Sheldon, L. (1988). Evaluating ELT textbooks and materials. ELT Journal, 42(4), s.237-46.
- Solak, M., & Yaylı, D. (2009). İlköğretim ikinci kademe Türkçe ders kitaplarının türler açısından incelenmesi. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 2(9), 444-453.
- Somuncu, S. (2008). İlköğretim 7. sınıf Türkçe ders kitabındaki edebî metinlerin temel evrensel değerleri içermesi bakımından incelenmesi [Unpublished Master's Thesis]. Afyonkarahisar Kocatepe University.
- Tarakcı, R, & Karagöl, E. (2019a). Konusma kazanımları açısından ortaokul Türkçe ders kitapları. *Turkish* Studies, 14(4), 1257-1269. DOI:10.29228/TurkishStudies.22958
- Tarakcı, R, & Karagöl, E. (2019b). Söz varlığı öğretimi açısından ortaokul Türkçe ders kitapları. *Milli Eğitim, 48*(222), 149-171.
- TDK (1974). Eğitim terimleri sözlüğü. TDK.

- TEGM (2019). İlköğretim kurumları (ilkokul ve ortaokul) haftalık ders çizelgesi. Retrieved from http://tegm.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2018_09/20193921_123_sayYIY__Yizelge.pdf
- Tertemiz, N., Ercan, İ. & Kayabaşı, Y. (2011). Ders kitabı ve eğitimdeki önemi. In L. Küçükahmet, (Eds.), *Konu alanı ders kitabı inceleme kılavuzu* (pp.34-66). Nobel Yayınevi.
- Türkben, T. (2019a). Investigation of text pictures in Turkish textbooks, *Inonu University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, 20(2), 650-672. DOI: 10.17679/inuefd.547841
- Türkben, T. (2019b). Readability characteristics of texts in middle school Turkish textbooks. *Educational Policy Analysis and Strategic Research*, *14*(3), 80-105. DOI: 10.29329/epasr.2019.208.5
- Ülper, H & Yalınkılıç, K. (2010). Son iki Türkçe programına göre hazırlanan Türkçe ders kitaplarındaki metin sonu sorularının nicel ve nitel görünümü. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 3(12), 449-461.
- Wagener, A. (2014). Deutschbuch 6 sprach-und lesebuch. Cornelsen.
- WDE (2007). Word data on education 2006/07. Retrieved from www.ibe.unesco.org
- Yavuz, F. (2006). Okul motivasyonunu değerlendirme ölçeği yapılandırılması ve güvenirliği [Unpublished Master's Thesis]. Marmara University Institute of Education Sciences.
- Yaylı, D. (2006). The effects of task-based learning on male and female learners' proficiency and noticing. *Ç.Ü. Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 15*(1), 449-468.
- Yaylı, D. (2020). Türkçe öğretim programı ve ders kitapları. In Hakan Ülper (Eds.), *Türkçe Ders Kitabı Çözümlemeleri* (pp.23-42). PegemA Yayıncılık.
- Yazıcı Okuyan, H. (2012). İlköğretim Türkçe ders kitaplarında bir kültür aktarımı aracı olarak kalıp sözlerin kullanımı üzerine bir inceleme. *TSA*, 162, 31-46.
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2018). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. Seçkin.
- Yıldız, D., Altun, K., Ceran, D., Dağ, A. & Özgül, E. (2019). Ortaokul Türkçe ders kitaplarındaki metinler üzerine bir inceleme, *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, (7)*4, 439-460. DOI:10.29228/ijlet.38837
- Yurdugül, H. (2005). Ölçek geliştirme çalışmalarında kapsam geçerliği için kapsam geçerlik indekslerinin kullanılması. *XIV. Ulusal Eğitim Bilimleri Kongresi*, 1, 771-774.
- Кирил Пејчиновиќ, 2018). Годишна програма на основното училиште *КИРИЛ ПЕЈЧИНОВИЌ*, Кисела Вода Скопје. Retrieved from http://www.kirilpejcinvic.edu.mk/files/documents/file_path/2c44bc25-60ad-4ce0-8e5a-14f3b1ecea00/GP KirilPejcinovic 2017-2018%20fin.pdf
- Службен весник (2019). Собрание на република северна македонија. *Службен весник на РСМ*, бр. 161 од 5.8.2019 година. Retrieved from https://www.mtsp.gov.mk/content/ZPIO%20br.267-2020.pdf